

NUTRITION EVIDENCE SYSTEMATIC REVIEW GRADING RUBRIC

Element	Grade I: Strong	Grade II: Moderate	Grade III: Limited	Grade IV: Grade Not Assignable
Internal Validity of the Evidence <i>(determined with the NEL Bias Assessment Tool)</i>	Across the body of evidence there is a <u>strong</u> likelihood that the reported effects are the true effects of the intervention/ exposure and not over- or underestimations resulting from bias due to study design or conduct	Across the body of evidence there is a <u>moderate</u> likelihood that the reported effects are the true effects of the intervention/ exposure and not over - or underestimations resulting from bias due to study design or conduct	Across the body of evidence there is a <u>limited</u> likelihood that the reported effects are the true effects of the intervention/exposure; they are more likely to be over- or underestimations resulting from bias due to study design or conduct	<i>A <u>grade is not assignable</u> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed</i>
Adequacy of Evidence	The body of evidence has a <u>strong</u> number of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • studies overall • studies by independent research groups • studies with sample sizes that are sufficient to avoid type I and II errors • participants overall 	The body of evidence has is a <u>moderate</u> number of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • studies overall • studies by independent research groups • studies with sample sizes that are sufficient to avoid type I and II errors • participants overall 	The body of evidence has a <u>limited</u> number of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • studies overall • studies by independent research groups • studies with sample sizes that are sufficient to avoid type I and II errors • participants overall 	<i>A <u>grade is not assignable</u> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed</i>
Consistency of the Evidence	Across the body of evidence, the findings have a <u>strong</u> consistency in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • direction • size of effect/degree of association • statistical significance 	Across the body of evidence, the findings have a <u>moderate</u> consistency in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • direction • size of effect/degree of association • statistical significance e.g., <i>some explainable</i> inconsistencies	Across the body of evidence, the findings have a <u>limited</u> consistency in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • direction • size of effect/degree of association • statistical significance e.g., <i>several explainable</i> inconsistencies; <i>some unexplainable</i> inconsistencies	<i>A <u>grade is not assignable</u> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed</i>

Impact of the Evidence	<p>The body of evidence demonstrates a <u>strong</u> impact, as evidenced by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the directness with which the study designs examine the link between the intervention/exposure and outcome of interest in the systematic review question • the statistical significance • the practical/clinical significance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The body of evidence demonstrates a <u>moderate</u> impact, as evidenced by: • the directness with which the study designs examine the link between the intervention/exposure and outcome of interest in the systematic review question • the statistical significance • the practical/clinical significance • e.g., <i>some</i> studies were direct; there is <i>some</i> likelihood of practical/clinical significance 	<p>The body of evidence demonstrates a <u>limited</u> impact, as evidenced by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the directness with which the study designs examine the link between the intervention/exposure and outcome of interest in the systematic review question • the statistical significance • the practical/clinical significance • e.g., <i>few</i> studies were direct; there is <i>little</i> likelihood of practical/clinical significance 	<p>A <u>grade is not assignable</u> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed</p>
Generalizability of the Evidence	<p>The body of evidence has <u>strong</u> generalizability to the U.S. population of interest with regard to:</p> <p>the study samples</p> <p>the intervention/exposure and outcomes studied</p> <p>e.g., <i>no serious doubts</i> about generalizability</p>	<p>The body of evidence has <u>moderate</u> generalizability to the U.S. population of interest with regard to:</p> <p>the study samples</p> <p>the intervention/exposure and outcomes studied</p> <p>e.g., <i>some doubts</i> about generalizability</p>	<p>The body of evidence has <u>limited</u> generalizability to the U.S. population of interest with regard to:</p> <p>the study samples</p> <p>the intervention/exposure and outcomes studied</p> <p>e.g., <i>serious doubts</i> about generalizability</p>	<p>A <u>grade is not assignable</u> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed</p>