

# Nutrition Evidence Systematic Review Grading Rubric

|                         | <b>Strong</b>   | <b>Moderate</b>   | <b>Limited</b>   | <b>Grade Not Assignable</b>   |
|-------------------------|---|---|--|---|
| <b>Risk of bias</b>     | Across the body of evidence, there is a <b><i>strong</i></b> likelihood that the design and conduct of the studies has prevented or minimized bias such that the reported results are the true effects of the intervention/ exposure, and plausible bias and/or potential limitations are unlikely to alter the results | Across the body of evidence, there is a <b><i>moderate</i></b> likelihood that the design and conduct of the studies has prevented or minimized bias such that the reported results are the true effects of the intervention/ exposure, and plausible bias and/or potential limitations are unlikely to alter the results | Across the body of evidence, there is a <b><i>limited</i></b> likelihood that the design and conduct of the studies has prevented or minimized bias such that the reported results may not be the true effects of the intervention/ exposure, and plausible bias and/or potential limitations may have altered the results | A <b><i>grade is not assignable</i></b> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed |
| <b>Consistency</b>      | The body of evidence demonstrates findings with <b><i>strong</i></b> consistency in direction and magnitude of effect; or, any inconsistencies in findings can be explained by methodological differences   | The body of evidence demonstrates findings with <b><i>moderate</i></b> consistency in direction and magnitude of effect; some of the inconsistencies in findings can be explained by methodological differences   | The body of evidence demonstrates findings with <b><i>limited</i></b> consistency in direction and magnitude of effect; few of the inconsistencies in findings can be explained by methodological differences  | A <b><i>grade is not assignable</i></b> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed |
| <b>Directness</b>       | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>strong</i></b> directness, such that studies are designed to directly examine the relationships among intervention/exposure, comparator, and outcomes of primary interest in the systematic review question   | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>moderate</i></b> directness, such that some studies are designed to directly examine the relationships among intervention/exposure, comparator, and/or outcomes of primary interest in the systematic review question   | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>limited</i></b> directness, such that few studies are designed to directly examine the relationships among intervention/exposure, comparator, and/or outcomes of primary interest in the systematic review question  | A <b><i>grade is not assignable</i></b> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed |
| <b>Precision</b>        | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>strong</i></b> precision based on a substantial number of sufficiently-powered studies with a narrow assessment of variance   | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>moderate</i></b> precision based on an adequate number of sufficiently-powered studies with a narrow assessment of variance   | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>limited</i></b> precision based on an inadequate number of sufficiently-powered studies with a narrow assessment of variance   | A <b><i>grade is not assignable</i></b> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed |
| <b>Generalizability</b> | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>strong</i></b> generalizability to the U.S. population of interest with regard to:<br>a) the participant characteristics<br>b) the intervention/exposure and outcomes studied   | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>moderate</i></b> generalizability to the U.S. population of interest with regard to:<br>a) the participant characteristics<br>b) the intervention/exposure and outcomes studied   | The body of evidence demonstrates <b><i>limited</i></b> generalizability to the U.S. population of interest with regard to:<br>a) the participant characteristics<br>b) the intervention/exposure and outcomes studied   | A <b><i>grade is not assignable</i></b> for this element because it cannot be adequately assessed |